



Animal Studies Journal

Volume 6, Number 1

2017



Animal Studies Journal is a fully refereed journal, published twice-yearly, devoted to multidisciplinary scholarship and creative work in the field of Animal Studies.

Editor

Melissa Boyde

Associate Editors

Michael Griffiths

Annie Potts

Philip Armstrong

Sally Borrell

Copy Editor

Sally Borrell

Design

Liam Fiddler

Editorial Correspondence

Melissa Boyde

Editor

Animal Studies Journal

PO Box U393

Wollongong

NSW 2500

Australia

Email: boyde@uow.edu.au

Website: <http://ro.uow.edu.au/asj>

Twitter: [@animalstudies1](https://twitter.com/animalstudies1)

Facebook: <https://fb.me/asjuow>

ISSN 2201-3008

© Copyright 2017 *Animal Studies Journal*

Copyright in articles remains vested in the authors. Except as permitted under the Copyright Act (1968) as amended (for example, a fair dealing for the purposes of study, research criticism or review), no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or communicated or transmitted in any form or by any means without prior written permission.

All enquiries should be made to the Editor.

AUSTRALASIAN ANIMAL STUDIES ASSOCIATION

AASA COMMITTEE

Chairperson: Fiona Probyn-Rapsey

Deputy Chair: Lynn Mowson

Secretary: Clare Archer-Lean

Treasurer: Yamini Narayanan

Membership Secretary: Rick De Vos

General committee: Christine Townend, Annie Potts, Donelle Gadenne, Nik Taylor, Dinesh Wadiwel and Melissa Boyde

WEBPAGE

Our website provides detailed information about AASA, including our aims and vision, committee profiles, list of members and member profiles, AASA conferences. The News Page lists upcoming conferences, seminars and exhibitions, new publications and calls for papers and proposals. The website also includes resources for animal studies scholars and teachers, an art gallery, and links to national and international networks and groups: <http://animalstudies.org.au/>

BECOME A MEMBER OF AASA

The AASA relies on membership fees to support and improve its initiatives. Membership fees mean we can continue to provide you with services such as our e-bulletin Animail, our AASA Forum, our Facebook page, and our website in order to keep you informed of events and issues related to Animal Studies, help you participate in discussions and take advantage of funding opportunities, and promote your research and community work. Membership ensures a listing of your profile on our website and the opportunity to nominate and vote (in person or by proxy) at our Annual General Meeting.

Waged members annual membership fees: \$50

Students, concession, or unwaged annual membership: \$25

New Zealand and International memberships for 2 years: \$50

You can join AASA or renew your membership online: <http://animalstudies.org.au/membership>

Editorial team and Advisory Board

Editor

Melissa Boyde, University of Wollongong

Associate Editors

Phillip Armstrong, New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies, University of Canterbury

Sally Borrell, University of Wollongong

Michael Griffiths, University of Wollongong

Annie Potts, New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies, University of Canterbury

Editorial Advisory Board

Dr Giovanni Aloi, School of the Art Institute of Chicago

Professor Steve Baker, University of Central Lancashire

Dr Georgette Leah Burns, Griffith University

Professor Una Chaudhuri, New York University

Dr Matthew Chrulew, Curtin University

Professor Deirdre Coleman, University of Melbourne

Professor Barbara Creed, University of Melbourne

Ms Elizabeth Ellis LLB, University of Wollongong

Professor Adrian Franklin, University of Tasmania

Professor Erica Fudge, University of Strathclyde

Professor Donna Haraway, University of California Santa Cruz

Dr Susan Hazel, University of Adelaide

Professor Andrew Knight, University of Winchester

Professor Amanda Lawson, University of Wollongong

Professor Susan McHugh, University of New England

Dr Alison Moore, University of Wollongong

Dr Cecilia Novero, University of Otago

Professor Fiona Probyn-Rapsey, University of Wollongong
Dr Denise Russell, University of Wollongong
Professor John Simons, Macquarie University
Professor Peta Tait, University of Wollongong
Professor Helen Tiffin, University of Wollongong
Dr Tom Tyler, Oxford Brookes University
Dr Yvette Watt, University of Tasmania
Assoc. Professor Linda Williams, RMIT University
Professor Cary Wolfe, Rice University
Professor Wendy Woodward, University of the Western Cape

Cover Acknowledgements

Cover image by Yvette Watt

Contents

Editorial _____	i
Contributor Biographies _____	iii



Rick De Vos

Provocation: Extinction, Encountering and the Exigencies of Forgetting _____	1
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---

Henrietta Mondry

Selecting Candidates for De-extinction and Resurrection:

Mammoths, Lenin's Tomb and Neo-Eurasianism _____	12
--------------------------------------------------	----

Carolyn Mason

The Unnaturalness Objection to De-Extinction: A Critical Evaluation _____	40
---------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

Douglas Campbell

On the Authenticity of De-extinct Organisms, and the Genesis Argument _____	61
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

Rosie Ibbotson

Making Sense? Visual Cultures of De-extinction and the Anthropocentric Archive _____	80
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

Marcus Baynes-Rock and Elizabeth Marshall Thomas

We Are Not Equals: Socio-Cognitive Dimensions of Lion/Human Relationships _____	104
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Madeleine Boyd

Painting with Horses Towards Interspecies Response-ability:

Non-human Charisma as Material Affect _____	129
---------------------------------------------	-----

Malcolm Caulfield

The Australian Animal Use Industry Rejects Anthropomorphism, but Relies
on Questionable Science to Block Animal Welfare Improvements _____ 155

Will Kymlicka

Review: Robert Garner and Siobhan O’Sullivan (eds).

The Political Turn in Animal Ethics.

London: Rowman and Littlefield, 2016 _____ 175

Nigel Rothfels

Review: Peta Tait.

Fighting Nature: Travelling Menageries, Animal Acts and War Shows.

Sydney University Press, 2016 _____ 182

Editorial: In whose interest?

This edition of *Animal Studies Journal* begins with an emphasis on extinction and de-extinction. The ‘Provocation from the Field’ is by Rick De Vos who provides a poignant reflection on how extinct animal species and their histories become selectively framed within human histories, and on alternative ways in which we might ‘encounter’ extinction. This is followed by four articles addressing different aspects of the ethics of de-extinction – the possibility of recovering currently extinct species through biotechnology – by members of the New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies at the University of Canterbury.

Preserved Woolly Mammoths in regional parts of Russia could make possible the de-extinction of pre-historic species, opening both ethical quandaries and speculative possibilities. Henrietta Mondry frames these relationships between extant scientific possibilities around the cloning of Mammoths in relation to cultural discourses. Her case study – modern Russian fiction and political discourse – shows that such de-extinction prospects cannot be purified of political ideology. Carolyn Mason offers an evaluation of the ‘unnaturalness objection’ to the concept of de-extinction, addressing different elements in turn, before noting the need for limitations and risk management. Douglas Campbell addresses the authenticity, or not, of such species, and evaluates the ‘genesis argument,’ asking how much value to place on the question of whose agency is responsible for their reproduction. The section concludes with Rosie Ibbotson’s paper which examines the dominance of visual representation within discourses advocating de-extinction and offers a compelling analysis of ‘what “success” might mean in relation to de-extinction’. Ibbotson’s exposure of the ‘anthropocentrism of the de-extinction gaze’ informs her argument for ‘multispecies phenomenologies’ and animal agency.

The papers in the next section turn towards lived human-animal interactions in three very different contexts. Marcus Baynes-Rock and Elizabeth Marshall Thomas describe the wary coexistence of lion and human communities in the Kalahari as observed in the 1950s, and use this to illustrate the workings of more-than-human societies. Madeleine Boyd also examines

cooperative cross-species relations; using the lens of ‘corporeal charisma’ she examines three different modes of promoting awareness of cruelty within horse racing, and explores creative interaction as a means of fostering empathy through an interspecies visual arts workshop with the author, Prince the pony and human participants. Malcolm Caulfield’s important work also addresses issues of animal welfare, in the context of the Australian animal-use industries’ welfare standards. His review of the science used to provide evidence for the development of various animal welfare standards and legislation reveals numerous instances in which there are significant flaws. As well, he provides information and examples which show that the development process of standards can be determined by parties with an economic interest in those same industries.

This issue concludes with Nigel Rothfels’ review of Peta Tait’s latest book *Fighting Nature: Travelling Menageries, Animal Shows, and War Shows* (2016) and Will Kymlicka’s review of *The Political Turn in Animal Ethics*, edited by Robert Garner and Siobhan O’Sullivan (2016).

We hope you find this issue informative and thought-provoking.

Melissa Boyde (editor) and Sally Borrell, Michael Griffiths, Annie Potts and Philip Armstrong (associate editors).

Contributor Biographies

Marcus Baynes-Rock is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow with the University of Notre Dame. His interests lie in relations between humans and large carnivores in evolutionary history and contemporary societies. His recent book, *Among the Bone Eaters*, documents his experiences conducting research among people and spotted hyenas in the city of Harar, Ethiopia.

Madeleine Boyd is an Australian artist and academic specializing in transdisciplinary interspecies art and theory. Her first tertiary degrees were in biology and environmental science, later professionalising an interest in sculpture and performance through arts study at the National Art School and Sydney College of the Arts. Boyd completed her Doctorate of Philosophy at Sydney College of the Arts in 2016, with a research project titled 'Horse/Human Entanglements: New Materialism and Non-Human Perspectives in Contemporary Art'. Boyd has co-curated and exhibited work in group exhibitions with the support of the Australasian Animal Studies Association, the New Materialism in Contemporary Art research cluster and the University of Sydney. She has presented original concepts on art practice-led-research and philosophy at several academic conferences.

Douglas Campbell is a New Zealand philosopher, who lectures at the University of Canterbury. He has strong interests in many areas of philosophy – ranging from consciousness to metaphysics; from logic to de-extinction. He lives with one wife, three daughters, two dogs, two rabbits, and two mice. The mice are in charge.

Malcolm Caulfield has spent most of his working life as a scientist. He qualified as a lawyer in 2002, and fairly shortly after that became involved in animal welfare matters. He was Animals Australia's first lawyer, and he wrote the first textbook on animal welfare law in Australia. He has been actively involved in animal welfare law and science, with several publications in those areas. He is Principal Lawyer at the Animal Law Institute and an Honorary Research Fellow in the School of Humanities and Social Inquiry at the University of Wollongong.

Rick De Vos is an Adjunct Research Fellow in the Centre for Culture and Technology at Curtin University in Western Australia, and a member of the Extinction Studies Working Group <http://extinctionstudies.org/>. He has published essays on extinction, in particular its cultural and historical dimensions, in *Knowing Animals* (2007), *Animal Death* (2013), *Extinction Studies: Stories of Time, Death and Generations* (2017), and in *Animal Studies Journal*. He is currently completing a monograph on the cultures and practices of extinction.

Rosie Ibbotson is Lecturer in Art History and Theory at Te Whare Wānanga o Waitaha University of Canterbury. Her research concerns the intersections of visual representation and environmental change in the long nineteenth century, and she is writing a book titled *Picturing the Imperial Anthropocene: Visual Representation, Migratory Imaginaries, and Environmental Change in the Long Nineteenth Century*. Rosie also writes on visual and material cultures of de-extinction, and in collaboration with Barbara Garrie is editing a book titled *Things Change: Material Culture, Transformation, and Memory in Post-earthquake Christchurch*. Prior to joining the faculty at Canterbury, Rosie was a Postdoctoral Research Associate in the Department of Prints and Drawings at the Yale Center for British Art in New Haven, Connecticut, and completed her doctorate at the University of Cambridge, focusing on the international Arts and Crafts Movement.

Will Kymlicka is the Canada Research Chair in Political Philosophy at Queen's University in Kingston, Canada, and is the co-author, with Sue Donaldson, of *Zoopolis: A Political Theory of Animal Rights* (2011).

Carolyn Mason is a lecturer in the Philosophy Department at the University of Canterbury, and an ethicist on the New Zealand Ethics Committee for Assisted Reproductive Technology. Her teaching and research focus on ethics, bioethics, justice and public policy.

Henrietta Mondry is Professor in the Department of Global, Cultural and Languages Studies and English Department at the University of Canterbury, and member of the New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies. She is Fellow of the Royal Society of New Zealand and has had Visiting Fellowships at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge and Durham. She has published widely; her most recent book is *Political Animals: Representing Dogs in Modern Russian Culture*.

Nigel Rothfels is co-author (with Dick Blau) of the recent *Elephant House* (2015) and the editor of the Penn State UP book series *Animalibus: Of Animals and Culture*.

Elizabeth Marshall Thomas was a member of the first expedition to undertake a study of pre-contact San in the Kalahari. She has published widely on subjects ranging from her experiences with the San to the hidden worlds of microorganisms. Her books include *The Old Way: A Story of the First People*, and *Tamed and Untamed: Stories of Animals Domestic and Wild*, co-written with science writer Sy Montgomery.