



# Animal Studies Journal

Volume 6, Number 2

2017



*Animal Studies Journal* is a fully refereed journal, published twice-yearly, devoted to multidisciplinary scholarship and creative work in the field of Animal Studies.

**Editor**

Melissa Boyde

**Associate Editors**

Michael Griffiths

Annie Potts

Philip Armstrong

Sally Borrell

**Copy Editor**

Sally Borrell

**Design**

Liam Fiddler

**Editorial Correspondence**

Melissa Boyde

Editor

*Animal Studies Journal*

PO Box U393

Wollongong

NSW 2500

Australia

Email: [boyde@uow.edu.au](mailto:boyde@uow.edu.au)

Website: <http://ro.uow.edu.au/asj>

Twitter: [@animalstudies1](https://twitter.com/animalstudies1)

Facebook: <https://fb.me/asjuow>

ISSN 2201-3008

© Copyright 2017 *Animal Studies Journal*

Copyright in articles remains vested in the authors. Except as permitted under the Copyright Act (1968) as amended (for example, a fair dealing for the purposes of study, research criticism or review), no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or communicated or transmitted in any form or by any means without prior written permission.

All enquiries should be made to the Editor.

## **AUSTRALASIAN ANIMAL STUDIES ASSOCIATION**

### **AASA COMMITTEE**

Chairperson: Philip Armstrong

Deputy Chair: Lynn Mowson

Secretary: Clare Archer-Lean

Treasurer: Gonzalo Villanueva

Membership Secretary: Rick De Vos

Postgraduate Committee Member: Esther Alloun

General committee: Nik Taylor, Christine Townend, Dinesh Wadiwel, Melissa Boyde, Tania Signal

### **WEBPAGE**

Our website provides detailed information about AASA, including our aims and vision, committee profiles, list of members and member profiles, AASA conferences. The News Page lists upcoming conferences, seminars and exhibitions, new publications and calls for papers and proposals. The website also includes resources for animal studies scholars and teachers, an art gallery, and links to national and international networks and groups: <http://animalstudies.org.au/>

### **BECOME A MEMBER OF AASA**

The AASA relies on membership fees to support and improve its initiatives. Membership fees mean we can continue to provide you with services such as our e-bulletin Animail, our AASA Forum, our Facebook page, and our website in order to keep you informed of events and issues related to Animal Studies, help you participate in discussions and take advantage of funding opportunities, and promote your research and community work. Membership ensures a listing of your profile on our website and the opportunity to nominate and vote (in person or by proxy) at our Annual General Meeting.

Waged members annual membership fees: \$50

Students, concession, or unwaged annual membership: \$25

New Zealand and International memberships for 2 years: \$50

You can join AASA or renew your membership online: <http://animalstudies.org.au/membership>

# Editorial Team and Advisory Board

---

## Editor

Melissa Boyde, University of Wollongong

## Associate Editors

Phillip Armstrong, New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies, University of Canterbury

Sally Borrell, University of Wollongong

Michael Griffiths, University of Wollongong

Annie Potts, New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies, University of Canterbury

## Copy Editor

Sally Borrell, University of Wollongong

## Editorial Advisory Board

Dr Giovanni Aloï, School of the Art Institute of Chicago

Professor Steve Baker, University of Central Lancashire

Dr Georgette Leah Burns, Griffith University

Professor Una Chaudhuri, New York University

Dr Matthew Chrulew, Curtin University

Professor Deirdre Coleman, University of Melbourne

Professor Barbara Creed, University of Melbourne

Ms Elizabeth Ellis LLB, University of Wollongong

Professor Adrian Franklin, University of Tasmania

Professor Erica Fudge, University of Strathclyde

Professor Donna Haraway, University of California Santa Cruz

Dr Susan Hazel, University of Adelaide

Professor Andrew Knight, University of Canterbury

Professor Amanda Lawson, University of Wollongong

Professor Susan McHugh, University of New England

Dr Alison Moore, University of Wollongong

Dr Cecilia Novero, University of Otago

Professor Fiona Probyn-Rapsey, University of Sydney

Dr Denise Russell, University of Wollongong

Professor John Simons, Macquarie University

Professor Peta Tait, University of Wollongong

Professor Helen Tiffin, University of Wollongong

Dr Tom Tyler, Oxford Brookes University

Dr Yvette Watt, University of Tasmania

Assoc. Professor Linda Williams, RMIT University

Professor Cary Wolfe, Rice University

Professor Wendy Woodward, University of the Western Cape

### **Cover Acknowledgements**

Cover image by Yvette Watt

# Contents

---

Editorial _____	i
Contributor Biographies _____	iii

## **Elan Abrell**

<b>Introduction:</b> Interrogating Captive Freedom: The Possibilities and Limits of Animal Sanctuaries _____	1
---	---

## **Amy Fultz**

A Guide for Modern Sanctuaries with Examples from a Captive Chimpanzee Sanctuary _____	9
---	---

## **Erika Fleury**

Money for Monkeys, and More: Ensuring Sanctuary Retirement of Nonhuman Primates _____	30
--	----

## **Catherine Doyle**

Captive Wildlife Sanctuaries: Definition, Ethical Considerations and Public Perception _____	55
---	----

## **Guy Scotton**

Duties to Socialise with Domesticated Animals: Farmed Animal Sanctuaries as Frontiers of Friendship _____	86
--	----

## **Anna Boswell**

Settler Sanctuaries and the Stoat-Free State _____	109
--	-----

## **Sabrina Fusari**

What is an Animal Sanctuary? Evidence from Applied Linguistics _____	137
--	-----

## **Delcianna Winders**

<b>Provocations from the Field:</b> Captive Wildlife at a Crossroads – Sanctuaries, Accreditation, and Humane-Washing _____	161
--	-----

## **Camila Cossío**

Condors in a Cage _____	179
-------------------------	-----

**Peta Tait**

**Performance Review:** Species Blindness: Is There a Role for a Quoll? \_\_\_\_\_ 187

**Richard Twine**

A Practice Theory Framework for Understanding Vegan Transition \_\_\_\_\_ 192

**Carol Gigliotti**

**Review:** Annie Potts (ed).

*Meat Culture.*

Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2016. xii, 295 pp. \_\_\_\_\_ 225

**Henrietta Mondry**

**Review:** Ann-Sofie Lönngren.

*Following the Animal: Power, Agency, and Human-Animal Transformations in Modern, Northern-European Literature.*

Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. 2015. 213 pp. Index. \_\_\_\_\_ 233

**Philip Armstrong**

**Review:** Dinesh Wadiwel. *The War Against Animals.*

Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2015. xii, 302pp \_\_\_\_\_ 237

## Editorial: Sanctuary

---

This special sanctuary edition of the *Animal Studies Journal* is dedicated to Minuet, who died not long ago after living an exceptionally long life for a cow in this world. She was 26 years old, almost 27. Minuet was a Friesian cow who lived all her life in the same little herd at a farm which in many ways resembles a sanctuary, in the sense of a sanctuary as a place where the animal's life and wellbeing is of central importance; but also a sanctuary in the sense of the limitations that almost always includes – human control and lifelong captivity. I was there when she was born, and when she died, and I think she had a happy life, even though at times it was clear to me that she suffered humans gladly in the face of our inadequacies. Without the sanctuary of the farm she may, like her mother, have been sold at the saleyards when only a few weeks old (I saw her there and took her home), or she may have found herself captive and put to work in a dairy farm like her grandmother. Sanctuary seems utopic in the face of these kinds of realities for cows; but, as Foucault suggests, utopias are not real.

In his introduction to this special edition of the journal, Elan Abrell takes up Foucault's idea of counter-sites – heterotopias – and finds for sanctuaries the possibility of 'co-creating species-queered heterotopias'. As guest editor he has carefully curated papers by academics and from the field which provide critiques and insights into the 'possibilities and limits' of 'captive freedom'.

Also in this edition there is a strong and vivid short story by Camila Cossío; a review by academic and playwright Peta Tait which considers human-animal emotion in some recent theatrical performances; several book reviews including Carol Gigliotti's review of *Meat Culture*; Henrietta Mondry's review of *Following the Animal: Power, Agency, and Human-Animal Transformations in Modern, Northern-European Literature*; and Philip Armstrong's review of *The*



*War Against Animals*. There is also an essay by Richard Twine, *A Practice Theory Framework for Understanding Vegan Transition*, which draws upon interviews with 40 vegans in the UK.

I think you will find much of interest in this edition.

**Melissa Boyde**

**Editor**

## Contributor Biographies

---

**Elan Abrell** is a Farmed Animal Law & Policy Fellow at the Harvard Animal Law & Policy Program. His dissertation, *Saving Animals: Everyday Practices of Care and Rescue in the US Animal Sanctuary Movement* (funded by a grant from the National Science Foundation), examines how sanctuary caregivers respond to a range of ethical dilemmas and material constraints while attempting to meet the various and sometimes conflicting needs of rescued animals. His current project examines how collaborations between scientists, entrepreneurs, animal welfare advocates, and environmentalists are driving innovations in cellular agriculture, a new field of agricultural production intended to reduce the negative impacts of animal-based agriculture on animals and the environment. Prior to becoming a Farmed Animal Law & Policy Fellow, he was a Visiting Assistant Professor in the Urban Studies Department at Queens College, CUNY. He was also an Animals and Society Institute/Wesleyan Animal Studies 2014 Human-Animal Studies Fellow.

**Philip Armstrong** is an Associate Professor in the Department of English and the Co-Director of the New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies ([www.nzchas.canterbury.ac.nz](http://www.nzchas.canterbury.ac.nz)) at the University of Canterbury. His most recent book is *Sheep* (Reaktion 2016).

**Anna Boswell** is a lecturer in Humanities at the University of Auckland. She talks and writes about environmental issues in terms of settler colonial histories and human-animal concerns and has been awarded a research grant by the Royal Society of New Zealand for a three-year project investigating the history of zoos and wildlife sanctuaries in the settler south (2016-18). Her most recent work is published in *Settler Colonial Studies*, *Interstices* and the *Journal of New Zealand Studies*.

**Camila Cossío** is an Animal Law LL.M Candidate at Lewis & Clark Law School. She received her J.D. from the University of Texas School of Law. Camila is a recipient of the Richard Peppin Animal Rights Scholarship, the Animal Law LL.M Leadership Scholarship, and the Orlando Letelier and Ronni Karpen Moffitt Endowed Presidential Scholarship in Law for pro bono and human rights work. She served as a Public Interest Scholar for the William Wayne Justice Center for Public Interest Law. She currently assists in research related to the Center for Animal Law Studies' Aquatic Animal Law Initiative. This story is an excerpt from her LL.M thesis which experiments with different forms of narrative to explore themes of non-human and human animal exploitation.

**Catherine Doyle** is the director of science, research and advocacy for the Performing Animal Welfare Society (PAWS), which cares for rescued or retired captive wild animals, including elephants, bears and big cats, at three sanctuaries in California. She has a Master of Science degree in Anthrozoology from Canisius College. Catherine conducts research involving elephant behavior and human-animal relationships, and leads PAWS' captive wildlife advocacy efforts. She also writes about elephants and the ethics of captivity (chapters in *The Ethics of Captivity*, Oxford University Press, 2014, and *The Handbook of Practical Animal Ethics* (in press), Palgrave Macmillan).

**Erika W. Fleury** is the Program Director of the North American Primate Sanctuary Alliance and an independent consultant to primate sanctuaries. She has presented at academic conferences advocating for responsible primate retirement, and has published on the topics of primate welfare and sanctuary placement. She is the author of *Monkey Business: A History of Nonhuman Primate Rights* (2013) and is co-author (with Lori Gruen) of a chapter in the forthcoming text *Nonhuman Primate Welfare*. She lives in Los Angeles with her husband, daughter and small rescue dog, who is most certainly retired.

**Amy Fultz** co-founded Chimp Haven in 1995 with many others. Amy has been at the sanctuary since 2004. She is responsible for the socialization of the chimpanzees, and overseeing the enrichment and training programs at the sanctuary. Amy and her staff also conduct observational research on the chimpanzees as they adjust to life at the sanctuary. Amy has extensive professional experience after working in zoos, sanctuaries, and research facilities doing behavioral work. Her area of expertise is introductions, having conducted over 240 introductions at Chimp Haven. She has published and presented a number of scientific papers based on her research.

**Sabrina Fusari** is an associate professor of English Linguistics at the Department of Modern Languages, Literatures and Cultures of the University of Bologna (Italy). She holds a PhD in Intercultural Communication, and her main research interests include corpus-assisted discourse analysis, critical discourse analysis, intercultural rhetoric, and systemic functional linguistics.

**Carol Gigliotti** is a writer, artist, critical animal studies scholar, and activist whose work focuses on the impact of new technologies on human relationships with animals and on the lives of animals themselves. Her work challenges the current assumptions of creativity and offers a more comprehensive understanding of creativity through recognizing animal creativity, cognition, consciousness, and agency. She is the editor of the book *Leonardo's Choice: Genetic Technologies and Animals* and the author of numerous book chapters and journal essays on these topics. Her work has been supported by Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, The Sitka Center for the Arts, and The Reverie Foundation, among others. Gigliotti is on a number of international advisory boards concerned with animal studies. She now lives in Eugene, Oregon and is working on a book about the creative lives of animals to be published by the University of Chicago Press.

**Henrietta Mondry** is Professor in the Department of Global, Cultural and Languages Studies and English Department at the University of Canterbury, and member of the New Zealand Centre for Human-Animal Studies. She is Fellow of the Royal Society of New Zealand and has had Visiting Fellowships at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge and Durham. She has published widely; her most recent book is *Political Animals: Representing Dogs in Modern Russian Culture*.

**Guy Scotton** is a doctoral student in the Department of Sociology and Social Policy at the University of Sydney. He is an editor of the journal *Politics and Animals* (<http://politicsandanimals.org>).

**Peta Tait** is a Professor at La Trobe University, Visiting Professor at the University of Wollongong and a Fellow of the Australian Academy of the Humanities. Her research areas include animal performance and animal studies; Australian theatre and gender identity; body-based performance; performing emotions and their social meanings; and Chekhov's drama and realistic acting theory. Her books include the co-edited *Feminist Ecologies: Changing Environments in the Anthropocene* (Palgrave Macmillan 2017), and authored books: *Fighting Nature: Travelling menageries, animal acts and war shows* (Sydney University Press 2016); *Wild and Dangerous Performances: Animals, Emotions, Circus* (Palgrave Macmillan 2012); *Circus Bodies: Cultural Identity in Aerial Performance* (Routledge, 2005). Tait is also a playwright, having written seven produced plays and three contemporary performances.

**Richard Twine** is Senior Lecturer in Social Sciences and Co-Director of the Centre for Human Animal Studies at Edge Hill University, UK. He is the author of *Animals as Biotechnology - Ethics, Sustainability and Critical Animal Studies* (Routledge, 2010) and co-editor of *The Rise of Critical Animal Studies - From the Margins to the Centre* (Routledge, 2014). His web-site is <http://www.richardtwine.com>

**Delcianna Winders** is vice president and deputy general counsel for Captive Animal Law Enforcement for the PETA Foundation. Through litigation, legislative and regulatory efforts, and other legal advocacy, she pushes authorities to create and enforce laws designed to help captive animals who are suffering in roadside zoos or beaten into performing in circuses. She recently completed a two-year stint as Harvard's first-ever Animal Law & Policy academic fellow and has published in media outlets and law reviews across the country. Her scholarship focuses on the intersection of animal law and administrative law with particular attention to regulatory failure.